

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

BEFORE THE
ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF:)
)
SHARON YOUNG,)
)
vs) No. 16-0022
)
COMMONWEALTH EDISON COMPANY,)
)
Complaint as to billing error)
in Dolton, Illinois.)

Chicago, Illinois
April 26, 2016

Met pursuant to notice at 1:00 p.m.

BEFORE:

GLENNON P. DOLAN, Administrative Law Judge.

1 APPEARANCES:

2 MS. SHARON YOUNG
15105 Irving Avenue
3 Dolton Illinois 60419
Appearing pro se;

4 MR. MARK L. GOLDSTEIN
3019 Province Circle
5 Mundelein, Illinois 60060

6 -and-

MS. REBECCA a. GRAHAM
7 115 South LaSalle Street, Suite 2600
Chicago, Illinois 60603
8 Appearing on behalf of the Respondent.

9 ALSO PRESENT:

10 MS. JOANN YOUNG
MR. AARON JIMENEZ

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 SULLIVAN REPORTING COMPANY, by
Tracy L. Overocker, CSR

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

I N D E X

<u>Witnesses:</u>	<u>Direct</u>	<u>Cross</u>	<u>Re- direct</u>	<u>Re- cross</u>	<u>By Examiner</u>
Printiss Denwood	18	25	30	31	
Brenda Miyagawa	33	47	48		

E X H I B I T S

<u>Number</u>	<u>For Identification</u>	<u>In Evidence</u>
ComEd Group 1. . . .	9	28
2-4.	9	48

1 (Whereupon, ComEd
2 Group Exhibit No. 1
3 and 2 through 4 were
4 marked for identification.)

5 JUDGE DOLAN: By direction and authority of the
6 Illinois Commerce Commission, I call Docket
7 No. 16-0022, Sharon Young versus Commonwealth Edison
8 Company, a billing error in Dolton, Illinois, to
9 order.

10 Would the parties please identify
11 themselves for the record.

12 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Sharon Young, 15105 Irving
13 Avenue in Dolton, 60419.

14 MS. REBECCA GRAHAM: On behalf of Commonwealth
15 Edison Company, Rebecca Graham, 115 South LaSalle
16 Street, Suite 2600, Chicago, Illinois 60603. My
17 telephone number is (312) 505-8154.

18 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Also for Commonwealth Edison
19 Company, Mark L. Goldstein, 3019 Province Circle,
20 Mundelein, Illinois, 60060. My telephone number is
21 (847) 949-1340 and with us this afternoon is Aaron
22 Jimenez of ComEd as well as two witnesses.

1 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Let the record
2 reflect there are no additional appearances.

3 Miss Young, you're going to testify,
4 obviously. Is your friend going to testify too or
5 just you?

6 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Just me actually testifying.
7 She's just here for support.

8 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. That's fine. All right.
9 And then ComEd has two witnesses, so I'm going to
10 ask -- I'll ask you all to raise your right hand at
11 this time.

12 (Witnesses sworn.)

13 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Then with that,
14 Miss Young, why don't you go ahead and start, give us
15 your...

16 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Basically when I received
17 the notice, I don't remember who I notified, but it
18 was someone with ComEd and I had no idea as to what
19 they were talking about and they were supposed to
20 have gotten back with me and I can't remember if they
21 ever got back with me or not, but I ended up calling
22 for help.

1 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. Before you go any further,
2 I notice -- let's get specific. You got notice of
3 of...

4 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Like a bill
5 1,000-and-something dollars and I was concerned as to
6 why did my light bill jump so high and that's when I
7 believe -- I'm trying to see if I received something
8 stating tampering with and I filed a complaint and I
9 answered the questions on that complaint and as I
10 remember what I answered is right here. The
11 paperwork they sent me, that's when I put in billing
12 error, the alleged tampering was not caused by my
13 actions. The decrease in usage was not caused by
14 tampering, but by absence from my home.

15 The next one was what type of help I'm
16 looking for was I would like for the Commission to
17 dismiss the false allegations of tampering and
18 disputed amount of \$1,511.43. I signed it. I sent
19 it.

20 Also, I have a letter here that I
21 submitted to -- I can't think of -- for the formal
22 complaint. I am writing to dispute a billing error

1 in the amount of of 1,511.43 on my account as well as
2 the convoluted theory that it was I who tampered with
3 the meter in addition to the fact that I know nothing
4 about electricity, I would not endanger myself or
5 others. All my utility bills have significantly
6 decreased for the past several months and I now spend
7 days away from home. I am not and will not be
8 responsible for a meter located outside my home.

9 ComEd dates ranged it from April 24th,
10 '13, through September 8th, 2015. And I asked, Why
11 did they take so long to recognize the error? If I
12 was told about this earlier, I could have explained
13 to the Company -- to the Electric Company that I am
14 away most of the days -- when I'm away, most -- yeah,
15 most days as there had been changes in my family
16 dynamics. So basically --

17 MS. JOANN YOUNG: So basically what she's
18 disputing -- I'm sorry.

19 JUDGE DOLAN: I'm sorry, you can't testify.

20 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Oh, I can't testify?

21 JUDGE DOLAN: Well, you can as a separate
22 witness, but she's testifying right now. Okay?

1 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Because there's a lot I
2 didn't understand, so that's why I did ask her to
3 come.

4 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

5 MS. SHARON YOUNG: If there's certain
6 terminology that I'm not aware of, then I did, I
7 asked my sister to be here on my behalf because --
8 maybe she can explain it a little better than I
9 because I explained a lot to her.

10 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Let's finish with
11 your testimony then and if you feel like your sister
12 has anything to add, we can bring her in as an
13 additional witness.

14 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I asked my fiance to write
15 me a letter on behalf -- if that's acceptable. I can
16 give this --

17 MS. JOANN YOUNG: He wrote it.

18 MS. SHARON YOUNG: He forgot to sign it, but I
19 can get him to sign it. I can get him to sign it.
20 He's downstairs.

21 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, if she's moving to enter
22 this into evidence, we would object. There's no

1 relevance and there's no foundation for it, so I
2 don't think it has any probative value here.

3 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Well, I object. I think it
4 has...

5 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Okay. Well, I object.

6 JUDGE DOLAN: Well -- -

7 MS. JOANN YOUNG: It ties in with when she
8 initially answered the complaint.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: Oh, I understand that.

10 MS. SHARON YOUNG: That's all.

11 JUDGE DOLAN: Again, I have to kind of agree
12 with ComEd that I -- I mean, it's very vague. It
13 doesn't really give any particulars.

14 MS. JOANN YOUNG: I'm sorry, to me it shows why
15 her actual bill did decrease. At least that's her
16 understanding of it.

17 JUDGE DOLAN: I understand. I understand what
18 you're saying.

19 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Now, the pictures show a
20 device in this meter.

21 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. Ma'am, ma'am, please.
22 Please.

1 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Hold on.

2 JUDGE DOLAN: Again, again, I'm sorry, but we
3 have to keep a record here and I can't...

4 Do you want to try to put that letter
5 into the record?

6 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Yes.

7 MS. JOANN YOUNG: You want me to go down to get
8 it signed?

9 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Does it have to be signed?

10 MS. JOANN YOUNG: It should be. Yes.

11 MS. GRAHAM: Well, we'll just renew our
12 objection to having that entered into evidence.
13 Again, there's really no probative value there and
14 Miss Young herself testified about --

15 JUDGE DOLAN: Yeah, I mean, I think you could
16 go ahead and you can testify to the contents of this
17 letter that is saying that because you were living
18 more --

19 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Yes.

20 JUDGE DOLAN: -- with your fiance.

21 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Yes. I know nothing of a
22 tampering on my premises outside my house during that

1 duration.

2 MS. JOANN YOUNG: How can that prove that that
3 was actually in your meter? Do they not knock on the
4 door, do they not inform the customer?

5 MR. GOLDSTEIN: Judge.

6 MS. GRAHAM: Well, Judge, we have witnesses
7 here who will testify to ComEd's exhibits which are
8 being pointed to right now and so Miss Young will
9 have an opportunity to cross-examine our witnesses.
10 So if she wants to ask questions about that, she can
11 do that on cross.

12 JUDGE DOLAN: I was going to say that when it
13 does come to tampering, the Utility does have the
14 burden to prove that the tampering existed, okay, so
15 the burden is on them to show -- so when they present
16 their witnesses and they show these exhibits, once
17 they've completed their questioning of their
18 witnesses, you will have an opportunity to ask them
19 any questions about how they can verify this is your
20 meter --

21 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Okay.

22 JUDGE DOLAN: -- versus anyone else's meter.

1 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Okay.

2 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay?

3 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Mm-hmm.

4 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Is there anything
5 else you want to add then to your testimony?

6 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I would like to bring
7 something further after I hear the witness, then I
8 will come back.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Okay. Do you have
10 any cross-examination questions?

11 MS. GRAHAM: No questions, Judge.

12 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. Then why don't we have
13 ComEd present their first witness and then we can
14 keep proceeding from here.

15 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, we'd like to call our first
16 witness, Printiss Denwood.

17 JUDGE DOLAN: I'm sorry, what's the name?

18 MR. PRENTISS DENWOOD: Printiss.

19

20

21

22

1 PRINTISS DENWOOD,
2 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
3 sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
4 DIRECT EXAMINATION
5 BY
6 MS. GRAHAM:
7 Q Can you spell your full name for the
8 record.
9 A Sure. It's P-, as in Paul, r-i-n-t, like
10 Tom, i-s-s.
11 Q And your last name?
12 A It's D-, as in Dan, e-n-w-o-o-d.
13 Q What is your title, your position at ComEd?
14 A Currently, I work for the T and S
15 Department Services.
16 Q And what was your previous position at
17 ComEd?
18 A I was an AMI upgraded installer meter
19 technician.
20 Q How long have you held both positions?
21 A With T and S, about three weeks; prior to
22 that, I was with AMI for about two and a half years.

1 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. What's T and S?

2 THE WITNESS: That's my current department.

3 JUDGE DOLAN: I know. What's it stand for?

4 THE WITNESS: Transmission and Substations.

5 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. Okay.

6 BY MS. GRAHAM:

7 Q Mr. Denwood, have you been out to

8 Miss Young's property at 15105 Irving Avenue in

9 Dolton?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Why were you out to Mrs. Young's -- excuse

12 me, Miss Young's property?

13 A There was a work order to do a smart meter

14 installation for this particular address, so we were

15 changing out the legacy meter for a new AMI meter,

16 smart meter.

17 Q Do you remember what the date was when you

18 did this?

19 A June 2nd, 2015.

20 Q Okay. And do you remember what you

21 observed when you went to Miss Young's property on

22 June 2nd, 2015?

1 A Just -- we would do a visual inspection of
2 the fitting upon arrival. The pictures here actually
3 depict --

4 Q Well, why don't we go into the pictures.
5 So let's look at what's been marked as Group
6 Exhibit 1 and I'd ask that you explain what each
7 picture is one at a time, make sure everyone is
8 following along.

9 A So on Page 1, this is actually the fitting
10 on the back of the property upon arrival on site.
11 This is how it looks upon arrival before any
12 installation is conducted.

13 Q Can you tell what the meter number is by
14 looking at this picture?

15 A Yeah. The meter number is 142 233 171.

16 Q Okay. Moving along, do you want to explain
17 what's on Page 2?

18 A Okay. So after the visual inspection,
19 Page 2 is a depiction of what the fitting looks like
20 behind the meter. So once we pull out the actual
21 meter, this is the fitting and how it looks. The
22 components inside the fitting are in the upper left

1 corner. You will see the Terminal 1. The upper
2 right corner is Terminal 2. The bottom right corner
3 is Terminal 3 and the bottom left corner is
4 Terminal 4. Those are the four jaws for
5 connectivity.

6 Q Okay. Can you explain what's on Page 3 on
7 what's been marked as ComEd Group Exhibit 1?

8 A So this is just another picture of what I
9 discovered upon pulling the legacy meter out of the
10 fitting. There is a jumper that's going from the
11 Terminal 1 jaw down to the Terminal 4 jaw. It's a
12 green ground wire and, actually, in the previous
13 picture on Page 2, there's actually a plastic sleeve
14 which is what we term a disconnection sleeve, that's
15 typically used when an account is actually
16 disconnected, cut off for nonpayment. This sleeve --
17 there's actually typically two sleeves.

18 In some cases when we find a jumper,
19 there's actually a sleeve that's been placed on the
20 back of the legacy meter on either Terminal 1 or
21 Terminal 2 and what happens is sometimes the jaws are
22 so tight when we pull the meter, the sleeve actually

1 gets stuck in the jaw, so we would actually see that.

2 Q Okay. Can you explain what's on Page 4?

3 A So on Page 4, this is actually just another
4 closeup shot of the green ground wire running from
5 Terminal 1 down to Terminal 4.

6 Q Okay. And can you explain what's on
7 Page 5?

8 A So in order to make the installation a safe
9 process for me to continue, I had to actually remove
10 the ground wire and also anything else in the fitting
11 that's presenting a hazard. So this is just a
12 snapshot that captures the removal of the ground
13 wire, the jumper between the terminals so that it's
14 safe to continue with the install.

15 Q And did you take all of the photographs in
16 ComEd Group Exhibit 1?

17 A Correct.

18 Q And you took these pictures when you were
19 out to the property on June 2nd --

20 A Yes.

21 Q -- 2015?

22 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. And how do you know from looking at
2 these pictures and from what you observed that
3 tampering had occurred?

4 A The jumper wire from the terminal on the --
5 on Terminal 1, which is the ComEd load side where we
6 enter service down to the Terminal 4, which is the
7 customer line side where service is actually
8 transmitted into the home, a jumper running from
9 those two terminals would actually enable power to be
10 transmitted without the meter actually tracking the
11 actual usage of that.

12 Q Okay. And you said you went out to
13 exchange the meter for an AMI meter. So what kind of
14 meter was it before? It was a legacy meter?

15 A Correct.

16 Q And a legacy meter is read by a meter
17 reader each month?

18 A That is correct.

19 Q So would a meter reader who is looking at
20 the front of the legacy meter be able to tell that
21 there was any tampering just from doing the normal
22 job of reading the meter?

1 A No. As you can see, on Page 1, the meter
2 actually has a digital display screen with the actual
3 reading, so there is no way to really indicate or
4 have an indication of any type of tampering or
5 hazardous condition unless we actually pull out the
6 meter to see what's behind the fitting.

7 Q And the reason why you discovered it is
8 because you were exchanging the meter; is that
9 correct?

10 A Correct. We had a work order to do a
11 change of the meter.

12 Q Does that conclude your testimony?

13 A Yes. Unless there's any other questions.

14 MS. GRAHAM: We would like to move to enter
15 Group Exhibit 1 into the record.

16 JUDGE DOLAN: Is there any objections?

17 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Yes. The objection would
18 be -- so can we question the technician?

19 JUDGE DOLAN: Yeah, after I rule on -- I mean
20 if you want to do it, subject to that, that's fine,
21 we could do it that way.

22

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION

2 BY

3 MS. JOANN YOUNG:

4 Q So you were the actual technician; right?

5 A Correct.

6 Q Okay. And I don't know ComEd's policy, but
7 how does the customer know that this is their actual
8 meter or how -- I mean, wouldn't it be better if the
9 evidence was presented where it actually is in there
10 so the customer can see it -- see, the -- this
11 illegal device that was attached to it? In other
12 words, how do we know this is 15105 Irving, her
13 address? There should be another way to identify?

14 A That's something I cannot attest to. That
15 would have to be our system. We just get a work
16 order downloaded through a computerized device that
17 we use that associates whatever meter number to that
18 particular property, so that meter number matches the
19 property that we have in our system, that's what we
20 go by. So we verify the address upon arrival on site
21 and if it matches what we have in our system, meter
22 number, address, then we know that that meter is for

1 that particular property.

2 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Okay. So the reason why
3 we're going to object to this, Judge, is because
4 there's no proof in this picture of it being her
5 meter.

6 MS. GRAHAM: Well, Judge, we have another
7 witness who is going to discuss the billing records
8 and we'll tie it all together at that point.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: Yeah. And if you look at --
10 Exhibit No. 2, where it says, Meter No. on this
11 document here --

12 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Mm-hmm.

13 JUDGE DOLAN: -- it's the same number. Your
14 account number here is the same number as the meter
15 number.

16 MS. JOANN YOUNG: What I'm saying is that we
17 didn't actually see this.

18 JUDGE DOLAN: I understand.

19 MS. JOANN YOUNG: The jumping -- the cable or
20 what's inside the box. So, you know, there's no
21 proof that we know that that was actually there or...

22 MS. GRAHAM: Well, we have -- Judge, we have a

1 witness who testified that he went out to the
2 property and he took these pictures and he testified
3 to what he physically saw at the address. So that's
4 the proof.

5 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Okay.

6 BY MS. JOANN YOUNG:

7 Q And how many properties do you see a day?

8 A It just depends on how many work orders.

9 Q How many on an average?

10 A It depends how many work orders we have for
11 that particular day.

12 Q But you were able to recall the address and
13 this -- I mean, did you review it with your
14 attorney -- with anyone prior to today?

15 A As I mentioned, we had a work order that
16 actually identifies the address that we're supposed
17 to be at and we -- upon arriving on site, we check to
18 make sure that we're at the correct address. That's
19 part of our standard procedure.

20 Q So you can just look at this and you knew
21 right away this was 1- -- you can look at this and
22 tell this was her address, 15105?

1 A Well, before entering the yard, we would
2 actually verify that we're at the correct address
3 according to the address that's on the house and then
4 once we confirm that, once we're in the yard, we
5 match up the meter number to make sure it matches
6 that address in our system.

7 Q Yeah, but I would -- if it were I, I would
8 have to let the customer know. I would have left it
9 there to show the customer, you know, I would have...

10 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Something.

11 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Something. You know instead
12 of a letter coming.

13 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. I understand your concern
14 on that one, but subject to your objection, I'm going
15 to allow this document into the record.

16 (Whereupon, ComEd Group
17 Exhibit No. 1 was
18 admitted into evidence.)

19 JUDGE DOLAN: I do have one question. With the
20 jumper wire like that going from 1 to 4, would the
21 meter still register at all?

22 THE WITNESS: It would, but as I mentioned,

1 there's two legs where ComEd supplies power to the
2 load side on Terminal 1 and Terminal 2. So when you
3 have it jumpered in that sleeve, it's actually in a
4 way bypassing the actual usage that the meter is
5 tracking. So you would get some -- according to my
6 knowledge, you would get some usage on it, but not
7 the full range of the actual usage because of that
8 sleeve and that jumper.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

10 BY MS. JOANN YOUNG:

11 Q How would you know how much usage? Or is
12 this just like...

13 A That wouldn't be something that I can
14 calculate on site.

15 Q In other words, this might not have even
16 been worked on. Is that you're saying?

17 A No. Anytime that you have a jumper, what
18 it does is this actually --

19 Q I mean, 60 percent electricity coming
20 through? 80? 10?

21 A There's no -- it's hard to quantify it. It
22 basically is sending -- it's a way to connect our

1 service into the home despite whatever is going on.
2 If there's -- like I mentioned, typically, when we
3 have a regular service where there is no jumper, as
4 you can see in the picture, Slide No. 5, this is what
5 we consider a clean fitting and this is actually --
6 Q This is still her meter, right, this is --
7 A Correct. The same photos.
8 So when you have that jumper going
9 through from this side to that side --
10 Q Mm-hmm.
11 A -- you're basically bypassing the meter's
12 ability to determine actual usage.
13 JUDGE DOLAN: Any other questions of this
14 witness?
15 MS. GRAHAM: I have just one question on
16 redirect, Judge.
17 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.
18 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
19 BY
20 MS. GRAHAM:
21 Q So just to clarify for the record because I
22 think things got a little muddled, can you explain

1 what you look for when you have a work order and how
2 you know that the work order matches the address?

3 A Yeah, when we have a work order, we
4 associate on that work order what the address is and
5 we physically look at the address that we're at to
6 match -- to make sure that is the actual address that
7 we are --

8 Q And does each customer who has service from
9 ComEd have their own meter with their own meter
10 number?

11 A Correct. It's all identified by the meter
12 number.

13 Q So the meter number that you testified to
14 earlier that's on Page 1 of Group Exhibit 1 is a
15 unique meter number that is just for one customer and
16 that customer is Miss Young?

17 A That's correct.

18 RECROSS-EXAMINATION

19 BY

20 MS. JOANN YOUNG:

21 Q And you did say that -- did you remove this
22 meter? Did you replace this meter with a new meter?

1 A Correct. This was the meter that was found
2 on site.

3 Q Okay. But you took this meter away and
4 replaced it with another meter?

5 A Correct. That was what the work order was
6 for.

7 MS. JOANN YOUNG: That's what I was saying
8 earlier about I would let the customer know...

9 MS. GRAHAM: Well, that's not a question.

10 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

11 MS. JOANN YOUNG: It would be a question for
12 the customer.

13 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Yes.

14 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Of course. Not for ComEd.

15 MS. GRAHAM: I have no further questions.

16 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. I think --
17 Mr. Denwood, I don't think we have any more
18 questions, so if you want to call your next witness.

19 MS. GRAHAM: Yes. Our next witness is Brenda
20 Miyagawa.

21

22

1 BRENDA MIYAGAWA,
2 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
3 sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
4 DIRECT EXAMINATION
5 BY
6 MS. GRAHAM:
7 Q Could you please spell your name for the
8 record.
9 A It's M-, as in Mary, i-y-a-g-a-w-a.
10 MS. JOANN YOUNG: I'm sorry, I didn't get that.
11 THE WITNESS: M-, as in Mary, i-y- --
12 MS. JOANN YOUNG: I thought it was Brenda.
13 THE WITNESS: Brenda is my first name. I'm
14 sorry. My last name is M-, as in Mary,
15 i-y-a-g-a-w-a.
16 BY MS. GRAHAM:
17 Q Okay. What is your job title at ComEd?
18 A I'm a senior supervisor for Billing and
19 Customer Operations.
20 JUDGE DOLAN: Rebecca, before we go any
21 further --
22 Can you please give your name for the

1 record.

2 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Joann Young.

3 BY MS. GRAHAM:

4 Q You said you're a senior supervisor?

5 A In Customer Service in Billing Operations.

6 Q And can you please generally describe your
7 duties and responsibilities in this role.

8 A Okay. I supervise a team of billers. I
9 audit their work. I analyze problem accounts. I
10 handle customer complaints on occasion.

11 Q Okay. I'm going to hand you what's been
12 marked as ComEd Exhibit 2.

13 Can you explain what this is.

14 A Yes. This is an Account Activity
15 Statement.

16 Q What's the date on it?

17 A The date that it was issued is April 19th
18 of this year. This covers the period from May 7th of
19 2014 to April 15th of '16.

20 Q Okay. And whose Account Activity Statement
21 is this?

22 A Sharon Young.

1 Q And can you give the address?

2 A 15105 Irving Avenue, Dolton,
3 Illinois 60419.

4 Q Okay. And is this a business record kept
5 in the ordinary course of business at ComEd which you
6 have access to as part of your job?

7 A Yes.

8 Q All right. What is the current balance on
9 the account?

10 A The current balance --

11 Q As of April 19th.

12 A -- April 19th? As of April 19th the
13 balance is 1,538.12.

14 Q Okay. And can you tell what meter number
15 services Miss Young's account at 15105 Irving Avenue
16 in Dolton, looking at this exhibit?

17 A Okay. Yeah, I'm sorry. Right in the
18 middle, I beg your pardon. Yes. And then we changed
19 the meter.

20 Q So can you explain where you're looking for
21 the record and then also say what the meter number
22 is?

1 A The center column of the Activity Statement
2 you got date, charge type, billing period, read and
3 then the meter number, okay, and the meter number,
4 the original one from 5/17/14 was 142 233 171 and we
5 changed it.

6 Q What date are you looking at?

7 A June 16th of '15 at the bottom of the first
8 page. And we changed it to Meter No. 271 092 385.

9 Q Okay. Now, I'd like to draw your attention
10 to Page 2 of Exhibit 2.

11 A Mm-hmm.

12 Q There's a line item dated 9/15/15 that
13 says, Revenue protection tampering fee.

14 Can you explain what that is, please.

15 A Yes. A revenue protection tampering fee is
16 a charge that is assessed on accounts where it's
17 proven that the meter has been tampered with and the
18 customer has benefited from the service.

19 Q And what was that charge here?

20 A In this case, it was 488.61.

21 Q Okay. I'd also like to draw your attention
22 to a line item dated 9/8/15 on Page 2 of Exhibit 2

1 that says, Revenue protection and then has a charge
2 of 946.11.

3 Could you please explain what that is.

4 A Yes. What that is -- okay, at the time of
5 the installation of the new meter at that point, we
6 observed that there was tampering and it was
7 confirmed with pictures and it was noted in our
8 computer system at the time that it did occur. When
9 the tampering was discovered, Revenue Protection is a
10 department of ours that handles that kind of thing
11 and they were notified of this and what they did
12 after that was once the new meter was installed and
13 the situation was corrected, based on the date that
14 it was installed and the next time they read the
15 meter, they determined an average daily usage.

16 MS. JOANN YOUNG: For that one?

17 THE WITNESS: Mm-hmm.

18 And how they did that was they took
19 the total, divided it by the number of days and that
20 was the average daily use. What this is is the
21 difference between what the customer was previously
22 charged and what they would have been charged had the

1 average daily use been what it was assessed once the
2 new meter was installed and full service was being
3 metered.

4 BY MS. GRAHAM:

5 Q Okay. I'm going to hand you what's been
6 marked as ComEd Exhibit No. 3.

7 A Mm-hmm.

8 Q Can you please explain what this is.

9 A This is a complete meter reading history at
10 least as far back as January 17th of '13. There
11 wasn't a great deal of activity on here which is --
12 abnormal activity. There wasn't a lot of estimates
13 with that. We were out reading the meter every
14 month.

15 Okay. Now, if you worked from the
16 bottom, on January 13th, the meter reading was 9659,
17 okay, and what happens at that point is that's what's
18 called a stuck meter. So it was recording no usage
19 at that point. On April 24th, we installed a new
20 meter, okay, so at that point, we looked at the
21 fitting and everything because we had the meter out
22 and we had the meter in and we started assessing

1 usage with the new meter that was operational.

2 Q What meter number is tied to these records,
3 can you tell from looking at this exhibit?

4 A Okay. I can tell you what the current was
5 on here.

6 Q Yes, please do. Can you read it for the
7 record, please.

8 A The current meter number is 271 092 385.

9 Q And is that the same meter number that you
10 read previously when looking at Exhibit No. 2?

11 A Yes, it is.

12 Q And is that how ComEd knows that these
13 meter records are for the same property of
14 Miss Young's at 15105 Irving Avenue in Dolton?

15 A That's correct.

16 Q Okay. And are these business records kept
17 in the ordinary course of business at ComEd which you
18 have access to as part of your job?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Okay. So you started to explain what
21 happened on April 24th, 2013. You said that there
22 was a meter that was exchanged; is that correct?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Okay. Can you also explain the line item
3 dated June 2nd, 2015, please.

4 A Yes. What happened then was we went out
5 and installed the AMI meter. So the old meter was
6 taken out of the socket, the socket was inspected and
7 the new meter was put in.

8 Q And how do you know that it's an AMI meter
9 that was installed?

10 A Because the first three numbers of the
11 meter serial number, 271, indicate that it is an AMI.
12 Also, there's the -- we have a computer system that
13 speaks with that and we can tell because we get what
14 they call pulses which is the way it reads it.

15 Q Okay. So looking at the usage from when
16 the AMI meter was installed and the previous usage,
17 can you explain whether the usage is consistent with
18 what it was previously?

19 A No, it's considerably higher.

20 Q So after the smart meter -- the AMI meter
21 was installed, the usage went up?

22 A Yes.

1 Q Okay. Does that difference in usage tell
2 you anything about what happened when the smart meter
3 was installed? Why would the usage have gone up
4 after the smart meter was installed?

5 A Because of the tampering that occurred
6 here, when the jumper was taken out, then nothing was
7 being bypassed, so the meter was able to record the
8 full load.

9 Q Okay. So I'd like to draw your attention
10 to what has been marked as ComEd Exhibit No. 4.

11 Can you please explain what this is.

12 A Yes. This is a spreadsheet. I took
13 information that was on the meter reading records
14 regarding how much usage took place during a
15 particular month so I could compare it between
16 periods of when they had the old meter with the
17 tampering in there and the new meter.

18 So, for example, in January of 2016,
19 9238 kilowatt hours were used. During 215 -- 2015
20 only 682 were used, okay, and in 2014, 604. So the
21 difference between 2016 and 15 is 256 kilowatt hours
22 in that one particular month. In February, it was

1 810 versus 499, so the difference would have been
2 311; March, 751 versus 582, so it was 169 and it
3 continues. Where the line is there is where the
4 meter was installed, the new meter.

5 So then what we would need to compare
6 was prior to that and the difference between 2015 and
7 '14 when we had the smart meter in, the smart meter
8 for the recorded 1228. In 2014 -- excuse me, yeah,
9 2014, it was 623. The difference was 605 kilowatt
10 hours.

11 Q So, in other words, the usage went way up
12 after the tampering was discovered and the smart
13 meter was installed; is that correct?

14 A That's correct.

15 Q Okay. Does this difference in usage tell
16 you that Miss Young was benefiting from the tampering
17 that had occurred?

18 A Yes. Because she wasn't being charged for
19 the difference.

20 Q Okay. And going back to what you had said
21 previously when looking at Exhibit No. 2 with the
22 revenue protection charge of 946.11 --

1 A Mm-hmm.

2 Q -- what time period did that cover?

3 A That covered the period since the meter was

4 installed up until the date the next meter was

5 installed. So the actual dates of it here would have

6 been from April 24th of 2013 until June 2nd of 2015.

7 Q Okay. So ComEd Exhibit No. 4, is this a

8 document that you created using ComEd business

9 records kept in the ordinary course of business?

10 A Yes.

11 Q Okay. Based on your review of Miss Young's

12 account, her billing history and her meter reading

13 history, is there any error of the billing or

14 rebilling of Miss Young?

15 A No. If anything we may have possibly

16 under-billed her because we usually try to give the

17 customer the benefit of the doubt.

18 Q Was the tampering charge and revenue

19 protection charge that we discussed previously

20 assessed according to ComEd's billing procedures when

21 tampering is discovered?

22 A That's correct. Yes, it was.

1 Q Does this conclude your testimony?

2 A Pending any questions, yes.

3 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, we would like to move into
4 evidence ComEd Exhibits 2, 3 and 4.

5 JUDGE DOLAN: Any objections?

6 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Yes. To the spreadsheet,
7 ComEd -- you know, of course the way they created the
8 spreadsheet, it looks like -- and the way it's
9 explained, it looks like there's some benefit here,
10 but it's too much fluctuation in here to say that
11 what is the average that this -- with the new meter
12 that you are getting the complete accurate record of
13 what was going on in 2014 and 2015, you know, instead
14 of saying maybe you used less electricity, you know,
15 and even here between 2014, you say that the
16 tampering happened -- well, this device was in there
17 you don't know how many years, but for 2014 and 2015,
18 you said it was there, but as you can see, there's
19 still some fluctuation in 2014 and 2015.

20 MS. GRAHAM: Are you asking for the witness to
21 explain the fluctuation?

22 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Yeah.

1 MS. GRAHAM: Are you asking a question? It's
2 not clear what your question is.

3 MS. JOANN YOUNG: My question is, you can --
4 she shows -- she's testifying that -- and you were
5 saying that it went up significantly, right? Can you
6 tell me what percent did it go up instead of
7 significantly?

8 MS. GRAHAM: I wasn't saying anything. The
9 witness testified.

10 MS. JOANN YOUNG: But you asked a question.
11 You also stated that it went up.

12 MS. GRAHAM: Are you -- what are you -- Judge,
13 I guess --

14 MS. JOANN YOUNG: What percent did it go up by
15 what percent would you say? Because you are using
16 words like "it went up," "it went up significantly,"
17 by what percent did it go up?

18 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. She's not going to be
19 able to tell you percentages off the top of her head.
20 I probably can guarantee you that.

21 MS. JOANN YOUNG: But she can testify that
22 there was a benefit.

1 JUDGE DOLAN: What she testified to previously
2 is showing that the difference in the amount of the
3 usage, like in 2016, you were at 938 and then she
4 took the 682 and minused that and that's where you
5 get the 256.

6 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Well, what about 604 and the
7 682 from 214 to 215? You know, it looked like it
8 would be the same across the board. At 341 in June
9 to 449, with the same cable in here and then a
10 different meter, maybe the different meter reads
11 higher. I don't know. There's no way for us to know
12 and I don't even see how this would be used as
13 evidence.

14 MS. GRAHAM: Well, Judge, because as the -- as
15 the witness testified she, herself, made this
16 spreadsheet using the business records of ComEd.

17 So you used the meter records,
18 correct, in order to --

19 JUDGE DOLAN: She took the figures from 2 --

20 THE WITNESS: That is correct.

21 JUDGE DOLAN: -- from 3 and put them onto 4.

22

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION

2 BY

3 MS. JOANN YOUNG:

4 Q June 2014 to July -- to June 2015, what's
5 to account for that discrepancy? Because you are
6 explaining 2016's difference from 2015. So June 2014
7 to June 2015, what caused that big difference there?

8 A I'm unable to attest as to how you used
9 your power at that point.

10 Q Okay.

11 A I'm only able to tell you that the meter
12 did record usage of the one year of 623 and then
13 after the socket was corrected, we recorded 1228.

14 Q No, I was talking about June 2014 and
15 June -- between June 2014 and June 2015.

16 A Of the 449 versus the 341?

17 Q Right.

18 A I'm not able to tell you exactly. I have
19 no way of knowing what the jumper would have been
20 diverting.

21 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay. All right. Well, then
22 subject to her objection, I'm going to allow ComEd

1 Exhibit 2, 3 and 4 into the record.

2 (Whereupon, ComEd

3 Exhibit Nos. 2, 3 and 4 were

4 admitted into evidence.)

5 MS. GRAHAM: If she has no additional questions
6 on cross, Judge, I'd like to ask one more question
7 just to clarify.

8 JUDGE DOLAN: Do you have any questions at --
9 any others?

10 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I have no questions.

11 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

12 MS. SHARON YOUNG: None.

13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

14 BY

15 MS. GRAHAM:

16 Q So just to clarify time periods here, could
17 you reiterate what you had explained before about the
18 meters, so the first time that the meter was
19 exchanged and the second time the meter was exchanged
20 so that we know what time periods we're talking about
21 when we're talking about the difference in usage?

22 A Certainly. On April 24th of 2013, we

1 replaced the meter because the previous meter was not
2 recording usage. So on April 24th of 2013, we
3 installed a new meter. On June 2nd of 2015, after --
4 we had notified the customer by letter that we would
5 be installing AMI meters and we came out and we did
6 so.

7 MS. SHARON YOUNG: Objection. I was not
8 notified.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

10 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I said that.

11 MS. JOANN YOUNG: So tampering was going on.

12 JUDGE DOLAN: All right. Hold on. Hold on.
13 She's still testifying.

14 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I'm sorry.

15 THE WITNESS: On June 2nd, we went out there
16 and we installed the new AMI meter, at that point we
17 inspected.

18 BY MS. GRAHAM:

19 Q So the time period of the -- I guess you
20 would call it the rebilling or the tampering charge
21 to cover the under-usage, covered the time period
22 from April 24th of 2013 through June 2nd of 2013;

1 correct?

2 A That's correct.

3 Q And your comparison is showing that after
4 the AMI meter was installed on June 2nd, 2015, the
5 usage went higher compared to all of the historical
6 usage up to April 24th of 2013; is that correct?

7 A That is correct.

8 MS. GRAHAM: Thank you.

9 JUDGE DOLAN: Any other questions concerning...

10 MS. SHARON YOUNG: No questions, just one
11 statement.

12 JUDGE DOLAN: Okay.

13 MS. SHARON YOUNG: I never tampered with it. I
14 know nothing about any tampering on my premises and
15 if all these changes were going on, you should have
16 notified me, knocked on my door or something,
17 notified me with a letter that I'm going to get a new
18 meter. You all found this and brought me or showed
19 me something. Right now, I'm looking at pictures and
20 I'm hearing statements from workers that work with
21 ComEd.

22 MS. JOANN YOUNG: Now, I have a question. The

1 technician, he has a camera, couldn't he simply take
2 a picture of the address or -- I have another issue
3 with usage. I know she was staying over at her
4 fiance's house, that's why that bill went down. It
5 didn't just go down for ComEd, it went for all her
6 bills, you know, and basically I guess that's it.

7 MS. SHARON YOUNG: That's all.

8 MS. JOANN YOUNG: It's up to the Judge.

9 MS. SHARON YOUNG: It's up to the Judge.

10 JUDGE DOLAN: Then with that, we will be marked
11 heard and taken.

12 (Heard and taken.)

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22